

Developing a Network to Strengthen Marine Resource Management in west Hawai'i

This report was supported by The Nature Conservancy under cooperative agreement award #NA09NOS4190173 from the National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's (NOAA) Coral Reef Conservation Program, U.S. Department of Commerce. The statements, findings, conclusions, and recommendations are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of NOAA, the NOAA Coral Reef Conservation Program, or the U.S. Department of Commerce.

Developing a Network to Strengthen Marine Resource Management in west Hawai'i



The purpose of this brief document is to summarize progress to date to build stronger connections between communities engaged in coastal and marine resource management on the leeward side of Hawai'i Island. To date, this has been done through two participatory meetings hosted by engaged communities. The formation of this group has been a bottom-up process as a result of the grassroots desire to make progress addressing known threats to coastal and marine life. The Nature Conservancy (TNC) has been privileged to facilitate meetings of this developing network of sites and provides this short summary report to update supporters of this initiative.

The current purpose of this group is *to communicate learning and participatory opportunities for engagement and support and to strengthen the base of support for management initiatives.*

Developing Network Progress to date:

Initial Meeting (9/2013) - Hosted by Puakō Makai Watch (Appendix A)

- Six communities represented
- Site management Plans shared
- Values discussed
- Communications plan developed
- Agreement to move forward together

Second Meeting (1/2014) – Hosted by Maika'i Ka Makani O Kohala, Inc.

- Eight communities represented
- Site updates provided
- Agreement to support community-developed fishing rules
- Discussion of rulemaking processes available
- Development of listserv

Participating Engaged Communities: Milolii¹, Ho'okena, Ka'ūpūlehu, Kīholo, Mauna Lani/Kalahuihua'a , Puakō, Kawaihae, north Kohala/Kauhola

¹ Representative provided written update that were shared at the meeting. Could not attend in person.

Recommendations for Next Steps

Honoring the wishes of the communities involved in forming this group should be the highest priority in supporting its formation. At the first meeting, only community representatives attended. At the second meeting, trusted state and NGO staff were also invited. Each meeting deepens the collective understanding of what communities need from one another to succeed, so additional meetings are a high priority. Structuring future meetings to honor the time and contributions of all concerned is necessary. Therefore, it will be of benefit to expose this group to more formal networks that have developed around coastal management in Hawai'i and the Pacific. Bridging the gap between well-developed networks in Fiji, developed networks in Maui, and developing networks in west Hawai'i will accelerate learning and inform next steps. This can be accomplished by a learning exchange or invitation of leaders from other network processes to future west Hawai'i meetings. The immediate next step will be to schedule a meeting of this group in Spring 2014, focused on refining their strategies for mutual support and introduce the concept of networking within and among networks to see if the group is ready for this discussion.

Appendix A - Coastal Community Management Workshop Notes²

Day One (Sept. 20, 2013) Summary

Goal: *Share projects, challenges, and successes and evaluate the potential for communities that are active in managing coastal and marine life to support each other.*



Attendees: Robby Robertson, Randy Clarke, Mel Malinowski, Charles Young, Lei Lightner, Francis Ruddle, Pi'i Laeha, Kawika Auld, Erin Zanre, Emily Fielding, Chad Wiggins, Jeff Coakley

What is community? *Those who have lived in the area long enough to develop an attachment to the land and ocean, strong enough to take action.*

Question 1) What does a healthy coastal environment look like for your community?

1. **Balance** - Natural and Human may be different. May differ from one community to the next or one place to another (e.g. different ponds at Kalahuipua'a have different balance). May have shifted from the remembered baseline. Ahupua`a system balanced resources at the local scale. "In the past, we changed ourselves to maintain nature's balance. Today we change nature to fit our needs." An environment free from degradation.
2. **Health** – Related to balance and concept of abundance. Natural and Human health.
3. **Public Access** - Related to balance

[Clean Water. Abundant marine life. Diverse marine life. Rich life on land and sea now and into the future. Healthy Balance. Free from human threats. A characteristic lifestyle practiced for the past 7 generations. A common relationship between community members. Activity at the Coast. Access. People following the rules. Healthy coral. Places for people to gather with family with shade.]

Question 2) What benefits do you receive from a healthy marine ecosystem?

1. **Sustenance/Feeding** – Physical, Mental, and Spiritual
2. **Happiness/Contentment**
3. **Learning and Striving to perpetuate culture and provide for the future**
4. **Jobs/responsibilities**
5. **Providing for family** – Mea 'ai (kauna: Mea = good, clean, healthy; Ai = to put inside)
6. **Balance** – a healthy system can provide this to people – related to Q1

[Happy Content Community. Sustainable living. Abundant fish/Marine life. Fish to see and eat. Healthy coral. Spiritual pleasure. Cultural refinement. Healthy land. Personal health. Sense of well-being. Sustenance. Ensuring a pono future mauka to Makai. Food, jobs, and happiness. Pleasure. A sense of well-being. Mea 'ai – everyone and everything around benefits]

Question 3) Given the current status of your coastal and marine area, what changes would you like to see?

² Italics show group brainstorming, Bold shows key points

1. **Improved management** – Mauka to Makai, culturally relevant (e.g. Konohiki), re-structure system
2. **Education** – statewide program for youth through schools.
3. **Balance** –for benefit and health of people
4. **Health** – human and natural not separated
5. **Policies** – Gov’t to consider environment when making decisions – fishing licenses

[Some type of replenishment areas. Human footprint removed. Educational programs introduced to youth statewide through schools. Home Rule. Management plan of sustainable practices. Better marine management. New management platform = Konohiki system. Mauka to Makai plan that includes culture, community, and education. Balance for the health of Hawai‘i’s people. Management to ensure fish nursery areas. No development damage to reefs.]

Day Two (Sept. 21, 2013) Summary

Attendees: Robby Robertson, Randy Clarke, Mel Malinowski, Lei Lightner, Pi‘i Laeha, Manuel Mejia, Sierra Tobiason, Chad Wiggins, Cecilia Poblete

Question 4) Does it make sense for us to work together as west Hawai‘i communities?

*More representation is needed; Communities are not always aware of other actions; **Sharing knowledge benefits all** (e.g. Ka'ūpūlehu process not well understood in Puakō, but could be modeled); **Individual communities have been working for 20+ years; Small communities can fight and win** (e.g. Pu‘uanahulu Community Association, surfers united at Capitol); **Other groups are already organized and working together** (some are working against communities); **Need an alliance or network; Big problems exist** (e.g. Drugs) – easier to solve as a group; **Hard to communicate to larger community; Technology can help provide conduit for info** (e.g. Kamehameha’s runners); **New technology is important** (e.g. Kamehameha embraced new technology to achieve goals – Fair American – Davis and Young); **Important factors for communities: caring for families, nature, meeting obligations** (work, children); **Empowers through involvement** (doing, not just hearing); **Cross site visits and exchanges help; Know when to step down and let younger generation lead** while we can still give them tools and knowledge to succeed; **United we stand, divided we fall.***

Pro	Con
Strength in Unity	Organization takes work
Meeting Support	Uncertain Leadership
Project Support	Can become exclusive
Initiative Support	Different <i>agendas</i>
Improved Communication	<i>Protocol</i> can stifle voices
Fresh Ideas	Burn out <i>already</i>
New Perspectives	Money
Accelerate learning	Coordination
Instill kuleana and mana‘o	Changing times/voices
Networking	Different <i>values</i>
Diversity	Motivation
Succession	Time

Question 5) What values do we share?

Kuleana responsibility/right, **Ho’omau** perseverance, **Lōkahi** collaboration, **Aloha ‘āina** love for land, **Aloha** love for one another, **Respect** for diversity of thought, **Integrity, Adaptability, Passion, Respect** for life, **Hawaiian Culture, Diligence, Honor, Honest, Integrity, Traditional Values practiced today, Good Science, Abundance, Ho’omanawanui** patience, **Sustainability**, Caring for the long term, Collaboration, Conviction, Listening, Welcoming, Family, Satisfying needs, Fairness, Belief, Perpetuation of traditional knowledge, Ahupua`a awareness, Balance, Harmony, Unity, Planning, Virtue, Investing in the future, Boldness, Preservation (nature), Duty, Stability

Common threads: Kuleana linked to caring for the long term, Collaboration goes with lokahi, Integrity, honesty, and honor are similar, Passion and Conviction are linked, Patience, Listening, Welcoming, and Aloha are related

When asked to choose top five values, the following *draft* shared values were selected by vote, and the assembled group requested confirmation that these values are shared by those who were unable to attend day two:

- **Perpetuation/Preservation/Adaptation of Tradition**
- **Kuleana**
- **Lōkahi**
- **Ho’o Mau**
- **Ho’omanawanui**

Question 6) What are the strengths of your community?

education, financial support, strong community association, willing to work and coordinate, responsible, reliable, accountable, affluent, conviction, ocean-minded, creative, aloha for place, committed people, empathy, resourcefulness, hiki no spirit (can be a measure of success – is community accomplishing goals?), common understanding of people, work, and environment

Strengths related back to pros and cons of working together as depicted on the table to the right.

Key discussion points: Communities have a diversity of complementary strengths, Not all necessary capacities were mentioned by those assembled (e.g. leadership), More time is needed for communities to truly get to know one another, Empathy is a foundational value

Strength	Relationship
Committed people	motivation, time
	succession, support, instill kuleana
Education	accelerates learning, support, instill mana’o
Financial Capacity	money
	support
Empathy	changing times/voices
	new perspectives, diversity
Hiki no Spirit	burn out, organization takes work, motivation
Creativity	fresh ideas, new perspectives, diversity

Question 7) Who are you working with to meet your needs?

State – division of aquatic resources, UH Hilo; Federal – national oceanic and atmospheric administration; Non-governmental organizations – coral reef alliance, the kohala center, west Hawaii fisheries council, puako community association, the nature conservancy; Universities – cornell, marine biologists; Community members – communities, Ohana, benefactors

Question 8) What else does your community need to succeed?

Networking, effective enforcement of rules, cooperation of state agencies, empathy, desire/motivation, governor to sign rules package, DOCARE boat, home-base facility (e.g. interpretive center to share information), improved government support, united community, common goals, big numbers, legal knowledge/expertise/training, fishing license, cooler inspections, gap analysis and research to fill gaps (e.g. herbicide and pesticide impacts)

Question 9) What do we want to work on?

Online communication forum: collaborative workspace w/ calendar, document sharing to engage people quickly and efficiently; Support for proposed rules; Additional meetings; Forming a working group; Exchanges; Review community plans (Kealia, Ka'ūpūlehu, Kaniku)

Meeting Outcomes

- Communities looking at big picture
- Broad based political support is powerful (e.g. surfers marching to stop reef runway)
- Networking helps share information and build support
- Technology exists to store and share information
- New policies and project successes will help communities and resources

Next Steps

- Mauna Lani Reef Alliance will build pilot online workspace
- Confirmation needed from absent communities
- Next meeting – 4 hours – mid to late January - updates

Appendix B- Coastal Community Management Meeting

Summary January 21, 2014

Hosted by: Maika'i Ka Makani O Kohala, Inc.

Kauhola, Hala'ula, North Kohala

Attendees: Jeff Coakley, Randy Clarke, Erin Zanre, Ricardo Zanre, John Kahiapo, Keone Mackillop, Leina'ala Lightner, Hana Visser, Keoki Carter, Ku`ulei Keakealani, Nahenani Tachera, Mike Donoho, George Fry, Pelika Bertelmann, Lani Bowman, Crystal West, Pi'i Laeha, Charles Young, Mel Malinowski, Robby Robertson, Rebecca Most, Manuel Mejia, Joaquin Mejia, Sierra Tobiason, Chad Wiggins



Objective: *Share updates, challenges, and successes in coastal community-led management and stewardship activities to accelerate learning and identify potential for mutual support.*

Meeting one Recap by Charles Young and Leina'ala Lightner: Communities gathered at Kawaihae and learned that we shared common concerns – cultural challenges with human consequences as the culture changes – state management and Hawaiian rights can conflict – found that common ground exists and people are willing to work together on challenges – gathering encouraged participants who are facing major impacts and have been for decades - being isolated can be a blessing in some ways, but not in others - working together can build momentum –united, the people can fight the rising tide.

Community Updates:

Ka'ūpūlehu –*“It's not about us, it's about the resource.”*

Three year process to develop rule proposal through Ka'ūpūlehu Marine Life Advisory Committee (OHA, Kona Hawaiian Civic Club, KS, Hualālai Developments, and na kūpuna/kama 'āina reps). During process, different views were shared and everyone's mana'ō heard – everyone did not always agree, but respected one another. Proposal is at DLNR for a 10 year Try Wait along 3 miles of shoreline to 20 fathoms – was submitted in August 2012. Support from HD, KS, and OHA in form of letter and funding for programs. Support from KHCC in meeting attendance and sharing information. Met with vocal opponents and William Aila and have been meeting with other groups quietly to share information. Next KMLAC meeting in Feb.

Ka'ūpūlehu is learning from Traditional Ecological Knowledge (TEK) focused on mauka-makai connections w/ support from Pelika and Tamara Ticktin (UH) - bringing studies together to understand seasonal changes. Creating a timeline of events – how did people adapt to change? Change is given, *key = resilience*. Developing interactive seasonal calendar as tool to understand 'āina through changes. Trying to create a portal for reporting data that community thinks is important.

Ka'ūpūlehu challenge is to get message across to opposition who tries to speak for Hawaiians and what they used to do in their place. In Ka'ūpūlehu, we still do and we want to keep doing. Needs support during Public meetings/hearing.

Ho'okena – Kealia – *“Hawaiians intuitively understand sustaining fisheries. As we begin to discuss [restrictions] people who have an economic interest will oppose us; what alternative will we give them?”*
Blending conservation and economy to find middle ground. Passing on opportunity for lawai'a camp this year to get house in order – interested, but need more time to prepare. Focusing on community input to avoid issues later. Non-profit looked at funding and how to get funds. MOA w/ county = County raised the camping fee so now there is excess revenue and more people (too many). Community can get blamed. Community took over beach concession through County MOU in response to overuse by tour companies – many kayaks and little respect. March 22nd = cultural day – beach will be open only to Ho'okena community.

Maybe we can blend the sustainability piece with the economic piece but there is a limit to what we know – no scientific backing. Almost starting from square one in community. Want to pursue community based subsistence fishing area – was originally included w/ Milolii proposal. Will need community support first – public support later. House by house if needed. Need to get youth re-involved and engaged.

Supporting the County AQ fishing bill, similar to what passed in Maui last year, requiring license, data collection, and inspection at Human Society. Important to have an advocate/lobbyist to communicate with decision makers.

Mauna Lani/Kalahaupua'a – *“Our culture lives through fishponds.”*

Ready to submit proposal drafted over two years w/ community members in South Kohala Reef Alliance. Plan to submit through West Hawai'i Fisheries Council. Advised to wait until Ka'ūpūlehu proposal was pau. Spending time developing educational materials b/c kids are key to long term success. Have interactive brochure about fish and solutions for elementary school kids. Working on book to go in libraries – school and public – that reflects issues for ocean.

Have a lot of computer and design expertise to help get information out there. Have connections in publishing – happy to share. Want to keep the quality of marine life that is unique to w. Hawai'i.

Hotels are neutral but work behind the scenes. Support culture, but new ownership/general manager at Mauna Lani, so future is not certain. Know that groundwater withdrawal is affecting shoreline – doesn't feel cold anymore, salinity has increased from 17 to 29 parts per thousand as freshwater is used upland. Resort is challenging development mauka of highway whose EA passed. 5,000 new homes have been permitted upslope – DW Ainalea – having to redo for larger area. Trying to get a baseline study. Working with The Kohala Center to gather all cultural info. on ponds in one place. Fishpond health could be better – no restocking in years since Oceanic Institute stopped. Working on increasing awa through artificial insemination – based on traditional spawning season – timing may be off.

Might help this group to focus on a single goal and work toward it – this was a successful approach for the loko 'ia hui that is working toward streamlining permits for fishpond restoration.

Will send around links to upland development impacts and groundwater work through community.

Puakō – *“Our coral is under attack. We’ve started an aggressive campaign to clean up our water.”*

2 mile firebreak runs behind homes – currently being mulched partly through FEMA grant to reduce the biggest threat to Puakō – Fire. 9 Beach accesses along Puakō Beach Drive. Lots of diving. Fortunate to have many reef and water quality studies – big deal if pathogen and nutrient levels are high. Cornell, TNC and UH Hilo studies look at entire reef – indicate that coral is under attack – action must be taken. Overfishing is important, but we need to address water quality. Need to take action – homeowners replace cesspools – this is our priority issue. How do we find support and funding to address? Eventually want a 10 year moratorium on take.

Addressing overuse through Makai Watch now – an educational program – partnered with The Kohala Center ReefTeach to share info. on reefs and how to prevent damage. Biggest challenge is volunteers for education booth. Makai Watch requires more training – Luna Kekoa is providing support – very encouraging. John K. has trained on identifying violations. Had 31 attend ReefTeach training on Friday (Jan. 17). Want to work with rec. and fishers to get on same page and work together.

Meeting with companies to learn about alternatives to cesspools – propane units are too difficult to install/build. Blue Water Systems replace septic tank about the same cost as cesspool – water is 99% cleaner than septic. Envirocycle also looks promising. Want to share info. on grants.

Kailapa, Kawaihae – *“Olelo noeau come from generations of observations. In order for us to make management choices on behalf of our ‘āina, we need to understand it.”*

Opportunity is for Kawaihae to utilize full watershed – entire ahupua`a for community health – nature and people. Starting 14 acre fenced enclosure to reduce erosion due to excessive goat population as pilot to see how well community can do watershed restoration. Planning 74 acre wellness park Makai – working with DHHL to define wellness. Not separating people and place – one can thrive and not the other. Goes back to traditional relationships – the health of people and the health of land. ‘Āina is sustenance in body, mind, and soul. Address things through an ‘āina momona perspective.

How can we say yes to our people instead of always telling them no? How can we understand the resources better so that we can continue to thrive as people in a thriving place. First priority is for kama ‘āina to have connection back to sustenance. UH Seagrant is providing resources to reconnect people to place – supporting fish gardens to hanai ‘ia - supply `ōpelu and aku ko’a and move away from undesirable feed (chop chop) – some fishers also feed reef fish – pick limu and put it back. Need to shift the balance – instead of 100% output, maybe 80% input (give) and 20% output (take). Hosted Na Kilo ‘Āina Iawai’a Ohana camp w/ Conservation International and hosting scientific diver training SAND camp. Mālama Makalii Ocean Festival Feb. 8th can come and share work community is doing.

Developing a portal – huliia – to turn over, search – to store information – looking at sky, weather, land, and ocean and within ourselves to change. Different systems have different timing and cycles. Starting to make connections between things that may or may not apply today – understand cycles to decide when to harvest or grow – let that guide us. Still have community work days. Networking and support would help.

Kīholo – *“Why do we go through this separately? The answers are all in front of us; the resources are here today. It starts with a desire to take action.”*

Last Saturday (1/18), 85 people came to fishpond workday – 70 stayed for talk story with kama ‘āina – 3 generations who grew up in Kīholo (Pu‘u wa‘awa‘a ahupua`a). We need to challenge ourselves like we used to. Children used to have to clean up – do chores – before they could do what they wanted. Kīholo benefitted from a management presence – Randy Clarke – that helped make important changes and people understand and care for the land now. Kōkua with fishpond. Outreach – planned 7 interpretive signs so people can learn about resource, history, and science and understand place. We are asking questions – we need to know more before we can move forward. What info. do we need and what do we want to do? Working with Conservation International to do household surveys and understand fishing.

Hui Aloha Kīholo received funding to renovate abandoned building for visitor’s center so applied for state permit. Since then \$160,000 has been raised for this effort but still waiting on a permit 1 year later – puts the funding at risk. How do we work together to do the right thing – sure every situation is unique, but it shouldn’t be this hard.

If we don’t formalize something then we will come back in a few months and have the same conversations. Even to formalize a goal so that when we come together we move a bit further on developing what we need to do.

Miloli‘i

Pa‘a Pono received grants from OHA and BWET for ‘Ōpelu Project, Hoe Wa‘a, ‘Ōlelo Hawai‘i programs with community members.

Closing ceremony for ‘Ōpelu Project is set for Lā ‘Elima celebration on Saturday Feb. 8, 2014. All is welcome to attend. Please share flyer with participants

Miloli‘i has a virtual online school through Kua O Ka Lā Public Charter School. We have about 25 students enrolled at the Miloli‘i Hīpu‘u site. We are currently in our second year of operation.

Community is currently addressing the issue of "chop-chop" for ‘ōpelu fishing

Working along side Kua‘aina Ulu ‘Auamo

Miloli‘i community plans to host another Lawai‘a camp in the summer of 2014.

Kohala – *“This circle of leaders is like a council, pushing forward providing leadership for accomplishing our goals/addressing our issues. We are looking at you for examples and lessons, we are learning from all of you.”*

Community of Kohala is strong but has changed – values have changed over time. Sharing is still a vital part of life – people still share. Used to catch big moi here (10lbs) and share with all the families on the way home. Had plenty of 'opihī, kole, menpachi, āholehole, limu kohu before – some places are barren now and some people are doing conservation practices on their own – reseeding barren areas with 'opihī. Kohala was so named by Hawaiiiloa who saw her from the east – means ‘the sweet breath of the

sun.' Land was given to Maika'i Ka Makani o Kohala, Inc. in fee simple, but in the Hawaiian sense we are stewards, not owners. Still have to pay property taxes. Awaiting final management plan approval to release funds to begin work. This land used to be lo'i with fishponds in the ocean and on top of the cliff (loko wai). There is a place where Kamehameha would meet the chiefs.

Hosted a camp to teach youth spear fishing but they had to learn about spawning seasons, life history, and pass a test first. When they go diving they still target the biggest. Grew from 5 kids to 10 to 60.

Revive values by reconnecting land with ocean.

Upcoming Events Calendar

Feb. 4 and 18 – County Council Meeting – AQ collecting may be on agenda - contact Charlie youngc042@hawaii.rr.com

Feb. 15th – Kīholo Fishpond Workday (3rd Sat. of the month) – contact Becca - rmost@tnc.org

Feb. 20th – West Hawai'i Fisheries Council meeting (3rd Thursday of the month) – contact Chad – cwiggins@tnc.org

March 8th – Mālama Makalii Ocean Festival contact Pelika - pelikaok@hawaii.edu AND Milolii `Ōpelu Project Closing contact Lei - Kainoa_12@hotmail.com

March 22nd – Ho'okena Cultural Day – contact Charlie youngc042@hawaii.rr.com

Challenges, Successes, and Group Needs were shared by the group and summarized in the tables below. These tables are not necessarily complete or comprehensive - some groups may not have shared all challenges and successes due to time constraints and not all challenges may be equal within each community. It is notable that all challenges and successes are shared by at least two communities. No community is alone.

Challenges									
Community	Addressing Opposition	Community* Engagement	Pace of Rulemaking/ Permitting	Funding	Shifting Values	Lost Connection	Sediment/ Erosion	Economic Alternatives	Development
total	3	3	4	3	4	4	3	2	2
Ka'ūpūlehu	1		1			1		1	
Ho'okena	1	1	1		1	1		1	1
Mauna Lani	1		1						1
Puakō		1					1		
Kailapa		1		1	1	1	1		
Kīholo			1	1	1				
Kohala				1	1	1	1		

*Community as defined during 1st meeting: "Those who have lived in the area long enough to develop an attachment to the land and ocean, strong enough to take action."

Successes						
Community	Funding Support	Cultural Practice/ Activities	Engaged Science	Community* Support	Limiting Development	Educational Activities
total	6	7	4	5	4	8
Ka'ūpūlehu	1	1	1	1		1
Ho'okena	1	1			1	1
Mauna Lani		1		1	1	1
Puakō	1		1		1	1
Kailapa	1	1	1	1		1
Kīholo	1	1	1	1		1
Miloli'i	1	1				1
North Kohala		1		1	1	1
*Community as defined during 1st meeting: "Those who have lived in the area long enough to develop an attachment to the land and ocean, strong enough to take action."						

Kōkua						
Community	Public Testimony	Messages to share	Volunteers	Event Participation	Focusing group effort/ organizing	Passing along Funding Opportunities
Ka'ūpūlehu	1					
Ho'okena	1					
Mauna Lani		1				
Puakō			1			
Kailapa				1		
Kīholo					1	
Kohala					1	1