

National Fish and Wildlife Foundation

NFWF/Legacy Grant Project ID: 0302.11.026551

Coral Reef Conservation Fund 2011 - Submit Final Programmatic Report (Activities and Outcomes)

Grantee Organization: Municipal Agriculturists Office

Project Title: Improving Law Enforcement and Coral Reef Systems Management in the Philippines

Project Period 09/01/2011 - 09/01/2012
Award Amount \$19,389.00
Matching Contributions \$19,389.00
Project Location Description (from Proposal) At the apex of the Coral Triangle on one of Philippines' most pristine islands, is Taytay, Palawan a center of species diversity and marine resources threatened by overfishing and habitat destruction.

Project Summary (from Proposal) Improve fishery law enforcement and coral reef management. Project will include community education, an eco-friendly guard station, and increased monitoring capacity.

Summary of Accomplishments At this point in the project cycle, many important achievements have been met, though a great deal of work remains to be done. We have successfully implemented two Soc-Mon capacity building trainings for local government employees and other stakeholders. This was beyond the original scope of the project and the Soc-Mon component has thus expanded to include seven community surveys which are nearly complete. In addition, a large patrol boat has been secured and is nearly operational. Additional funding has been arranged in order to provide for better quality MPA marker buoys as well as mooring buoys. MPA awareness education has been ongoing as well as community hearings in regard to MPA establishment. We have also collected GIS data for marker buoys at the Black Rock Reef MPA and identified suppliers for many of the materials and equipment that we still need to procure. Di-Not Island MPA guard station construction is also moving forward but will be ongoing for several more months. Overall, despite some delays the project continues to move forward at a good pace.

Lessons Learned Though the activities over the last six months have not always gone exactly according to plan, this portion of the grant cycle has certainly been a learning process. A significant difficulty in beginning project implementation has been working out the logistics of the accessing the grant funds. Due to the limited infrastructure in Taytay, funds are only accessible in the capital city on Palawan which has proven difficult due to the logistics of transporting funds for safety/security reasons. However, we were able to resolve these issues and streamline the process in a way that ensure the safety of people involved and the security of the funds. In addition, it has been a challenge to identify reliable local suppliers for the materials necessary for the projects, though for the most part we have also overcome this issue. In terms of these kinds of logistical arrangements it has been a learning experience for all involved but one that should contribute to the future success of this and similar projects in Taytay now that we have had to deal with these kinds of issues. On a personal level, I have learned the importance of strong interpersonal relationships and networking when implementing this kind of project in the Philippines. If it weren't for my personal relationship with local politicians, members of the academe, private stakeholders and community members, many aspects of this project would not be possible or would proceed an agonizingly slow pace.

Conservation Activities	Deliniation and marking of Three MPAs (Tecas Reef, Dinot Island and Black Rock Reef)
Progress Measures	Area included in MPA (square miles)

Value at Grant Completion	4.39
Conservation Activities	Establishment of Guard Station at Dinot Island MPA and full time guards placed at all three MPAs with sufficient equipment to enforce MPA codes
Progress Measures	Area within MPA under no impact ("no-take") (square miles)
Value at Grant Completion	4.39
Conservation Activities	Increase extent of seaborne patrols by fisheries law enforcers throughout Taytay Bay and increase MPA code awareness among fishermen
Progress Measures	# illegal fishing violations/year
Value at Grant Completion	5
Conservation Activities	Increase capacity of fish wardens to apprehend illegal fishers at the time of offense with the help of a larger patrol boat and radio equipment
Progress Measures	% of illegal fishing violations prosecuted
Value at Grant Completion	80
Conservation Activities	Train local government fisheries staff in conducting biophysical and socioeconomic surveys to ensure better informed fisheries and MPA management
Progress Measures	% of Human resources available for implementation of MPA management plan
Value at Grant Completion	80
Conservation Activities	Increase available fisheries operating budget by through more effective law enforcement and greater compliance with fishermen registration laws
Progress Measures	% of Financial resources available for implementation of MPA management plan
Value at Grant Completion	75
Conservation Activities	Increase local capacity for MPA enforcement with the installation of buoys, completion of guard tower, and provision of sufficient patrol equipment
Progress Measures	Level of capacity for enforcement in MPA (% available out of what is needed)
Value at Grant Completion	90
Conservation Activities	Conduct environmental and MPA awareness education in communities nearest 3 MPAs, instal informational signs, construct eco guardhouse with community
Progress Measures	% of targeted stakeholders willing to change behavior
Value at Grant Completion	85

Conservation Outcome(s)	The local government will gain the capacity to conduct effective fisheries law enforcement and implement all MPA codes
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	% activities from management plan being implemented
Baseline Metric Value	60
Metric Value at Grant Completion	70
Long-term Goal Metric Value	85
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2016
Conservation Outcome(s)	The local government will gain the capacity to effectively protect 3 MPAs and conduct regular biophysical surveys to monitor fish stock recovery
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	# of overfished stocks assessed at stable or increasing levels
Baseline Metric Value	0
Metric Value at Grant Completion	0
Long-term Goal Metric Value	0
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2016
Conservation Outcome(s)	The local government will be able to protect 3 MPAs, enforce fisheries laws more effectively, and stakeholders will begin to stop deleterious fishing
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	% live coral cover
Baseline Metric Value	31.8%
Metric Value at Grant Completion	31.8%
Long-term Goal Metric Value	40%
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2020
Conservation Outcome(s)	Local resource users will become aware of 3 MPAs, gain a better understanding of their importance, and become more invested in protecting coral reefs

Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	% of targeted stakeholders changing behavior
Baseline Metric Value	60
Metric Value at Grant Completion	80
Long-term Goal Metric Value	85
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2015
Conservation Outcome(s)	The local government will increase the area patrolled by fishery law enforcers with a larger boat and sufficient patrol equipment
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	Other (% of area under Municipal Government jurisdiction patrolled by fishery law enforcers)
Baseline Metric Value	40
Metric Value at Grant Completion	50
Long-term Goal Metric Value	70
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2014
Conservation Outcome(s)	Increase extent of seaborne patrols by fisheries law enforcers throughout Taytay Bay and increase MPA code awareness among fishermen
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	Other (# illegal fishing violations/year)
Baseline Metric Value	12
Metric Value at Grant Completion	10
Long-term Goal Metric Value	8
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2014
Conservation Outcome(s)	Increase capacity of fish wardens to apprehend illegal fishers at the time of offense with the help of a larger patrol boat and radio equipment
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	Other (% of illegal fishing violations prosecuted)
Baseline Metric Value	60
Metric Value at Grant Completion	60
Long-term Goal Metric Value	70
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2015
Conservation Outcome(s)	Increase available fisheries operating budget by through more effective law enforcement and greater compliance with fishermen registration laws
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	Other (% of Financial resources available for implementation of MPA management plan)
Baseline Metric Value	55
Metric Value at Grant Completion	60
Long-term Goal Metric Value	80
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2017
Conservation Outcome(s)	Increase local capacity for MPA enforcement with the installation of buoys, completion of guard tower, and provision of sufficient patrol equipment
Conservation Indicator Metric(s)	Other (Level of capacity for enforcement in MPA (% available out of what is needed))
Baseline Metric Value	60
Metric Value at Grant Completion	60
Long-term Goal Metric Value	75
Year in which Long Term Metric Value is Anticipated	2015



Final Programmatic Report Narrative

Instructions: Save this document on your computer and complete the narrative in the format provided. The final narrative should not exceed ten (10) pages; do not delete the text provided below. Once complete, upload this document into the on-line final programmatic report task as instructed.

1. Summary of Accomplishments

In four to five sentences, provide a brief summary of the project's key accomplishments and outcomes that were observed or measured.

Due to unexpected safety and security concerns, this project was ended well before its completion. As such, many of the projected project goals were not met. Despite the unfortunate early termination, we succeeded in capacitating the local government of Taytay in SocMon methodology and data analysis. In addition, we completed the socio-economic surveys of five coastal communities, conducted a large amount of MPA education throughout the municipality and secured a large pump boat for fisheries law enforcement activities.

2. Project Activities & Outcomes

Activities

- Describe the primary activities conducted during this grant and explain any discrepancies between the activities conducted from those that were proposed.

The primary activity completed before the early termination of the grant was a training in SocMon methodology and the implementation of several socio-economic community surveys. This particular training was very successful and well received by participants and the local government in general. Two local college professors, one NGO representative and thirteen local government employees from various offices were trained in SocMon survey methodology and implementation. Given the positive response of participants and support of trainers, we then enabled a select group of trainees to participate in an additional training on SocMon data analysis and report writing to further increase community capacity and sustainability. Though this second training was originally unplanned, we decided the long-term benefits to the community were well worth the costs and were able to make very cost effective arrangements given the support of the LGU and the trainers from Palawan State University. Additionally, the number of communities in which we conducted Socio-economic surveys was increased from five to seven in order to gain a more comprehensive understanding of the socio-economic issues facing inner Taytay Bay. However, due to the unexpected early end of the project, we only managed to complete five. In addition we successfully completed MPA education and advocacy campaigns in 6 coastal communities reaching 459 community members including women, youth, fishermen and community leaders. We also secured a large boat for fisheries law enforcement activities and began building community support for a guard station and the more formal establishment of three MPAs, including conducting community hearings for the final approval of the Black Rock MPA. All other proposed aspects of the project were unfortunately not completed due to the unexpected early termination of the grant project.

Outcomes

- Describe progress towards achieving the project outcomes as proposed. and briefly explain any discrepancies between your results compared to what was anticipated.
- Provide any further information (such as unexpected outcomes) important for understanding project activities and outcome results.

For information in regards to progress towards project outcomes as proposed please see activities section above. One unexpected outcome was the level of positive support for the SocMon training. Both participants and municipal administrators present at the training expressed their enthusiasm for the training topic and the lack of capacity in this regard before the training. The opportunity to train local government employees and members of academe in data analysis and report writing was also unexpected, but ultimately the follow up training made the SocMon component of this project

The views and conclusions contained in this document are those of the authors and should not be interpreted as representing the opinions or policies of the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation. Mention of trade names or commercial products does not constitute their endorsement by the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation.

much more sustainable. In addition, it succeeded in creating a strong link between the local government and the local academe, which was not well developed before the training.

An additional, but more unfortunate outcome of this project was that it unearthed some of the more deeply rooted issues facing sustainable fisheries development in Taytay. The project was unexpectedly cut short due to what was believed to be the inadvertent intervention of local politicians in the implementation of the project. Though it is well-known that a certain level of corruption exists within the local government of Taytay including some conflicts of interest with business ties to environmentally destructive industries, this project, in some ways, exposed the extent of this conflict. Though political leaders were supportive of the grant proposal and the process of securing funds, once major portions of the project implementation began, especially those portions targeting the reduction of illegal fishing activities, a series of events believed to be ordered by the local politicians created an environment of hostility towards the implementers of the project. As such, due to these safety and security concerns, the project was unexpectedly cut short.

3. Lessons Learned

Describe the key lessons learned from this project, such as the least and most effective conservation practices or notable aspects of the project's methods, monitoring, or results. How could other conservation organizations adapt similar strategies to build upon some of these key lessons about what worked best and what did not?

In the face of the aforementioned outcomes of the project related to the receptiveness of local political leaders to eliminating their alleged business interests in illegal fishing, we learned the difficulty of making changes in an area that conflicts with the interests of those in power. If nothing else, we learned that few things go according to plan. Sometimes those changes are for the better, as in the unplanned expansion of the SocMon component of the grant project. Sometimes those changes are for the worse, as in the case of the unforeseen conflict between the project objectives and the business interests of local politicians. Even a plan that strives to take all aspects of the project implementation into account will surely result in some unexpected outcomes, either good or bad. But one thing is for sure, if a project seeks to change the status quo, it is important to make sure that there is sufficient support in place to weather the storm that so often comes with change. In the case of Taytay, there is a great deal of this support. Support and desire for sustainable change from the community and many honorable and dedicated employees of the local government; however, there is also resistance to this change. Unfortunately, in the case of this project the resistance to change, much of which came from those in positions of political power with dubious business interests, proved too strong. Despite the unexpected and untimely end of this project, it is our hope that over time the community based desire for change will continue to grow and one day overpower the interests of those political leaders who have neglected their constituents. One lesson learned, therefore, is perhaps the time for this change is not yet here, that perhaps the influence of certain political leaders in Taytay is too strong to allow for these changes. However, we hope that this lesson is only for the present and in the near future the interests of marginalized fishermen and community members will win out and the sustainable management of Taytay's precious fisheries will be realized.

4. Dissemination

Briefly identify any dissemination of project results and/or lessons learned to external audiences, such as the public or other conservation organizations. Specifically outline any management uptake and/or actions resulting from the project and describe the direct impacts of any capacity building activities.

The most significant impact of the project tasks completed before the end of the grant is the SocMon capacity building trainings in monitoring, data analysis, and report writing. Given that a strong multi-sectoral team of individuals participated in these trainings and gained the skills necessary to conduct socio-economic monitoring and produce socio-economic reports, the local government of Taytay is now equipped to carry out these important activities successfully. The local government in conjunction with other stake holders trained in SocMon techniques have already conducted monitoring in five out of seven communities of Inner Taytay Bay and begun data analysis. They have the capacity to continue this monitoring and produce socio-economic reports. It was the original plans of the project to complete seven surveys and produce a comprehensive socio-economic report and it is our hope that the local government will continue in these efforts and disseminate the report.

5. Project Documents

Include in your final programmatic report, via the Uploads section of this task, the following:

- 2-10 representative photos from the project. Photos need to have a minimum resolution of 300 dpi; The views and conclusions contained in this document are those of the authors and should not be interpreted as representing the opinions or policies of the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation. Mention of trade names or commercial products does not constitute their endorsement by the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation.

- Report publications, Power Point (or other) presentations, GIS data, brochures, videos, outreach tools, press releases, media coverage;
- Any project deliverables per the terms of your grant agreement.

POSTING OF FINAL REPORT: *This report and attached project documents may be shared by the Foundation and any Funding Source for the Project via their respective websites. In the event that the Recipient intends to claim that its final report or project documents contains material that does not have to be posted on such websites because it is protected from disclosure by statutory or regulatory provisions, the Recipient shall clearly mark all such potentially protected materials as “PROTECTED” and provide an explanation and complete citation to the statutory or regulatory source for such protection.*